

INTRODUCTION TO INTELLIGENCE

Teacher: David CHUTER

Academic year 2018/2019: Paris School of International Affairs – Fall Semester

BIOGRAPHICAL INFORMATION

David Chuter spent more than thirty years in two governments, international organizations and think-tanks. A specialist in international issues, he has been involved in defence and security issues around the world. His last job was as Special Adviser to the Policy Director of the French Ministry of Defence from 2005 to 2008. After that job he took early retirement to become an independent author, lecturer and consultant, based in Paris. He is the author of four books and many articles, on subjects ranging from the organization of the security sector to African security issues, transitional justice and the relationship between security and development.

COURSE OUTLINE

Session 1: (title) Introduction: what intelligence is and why it matters

Recommended readings:

Two good general introductions by former government officials are:

- Michael Herman, *Intelligence Power in Peace and War*, Cambridge University Press, 1996
- David Omand, *Securing the State*, C Hurst, 2010
- A short but useful discussion of definitions by a distinguished intelligence historian is Michael Warner, "Wanted: A definition of 'intelligence' " *Studies in Intelligence*, Vol 46, No 3, (2002)
- Christopher Andrew, Richard J. Aldrich and Wesley K. Wark (eds), *Secret Intelligence: A Reader*, Routledge 2008, brings together a large number of essays on intelligence-related subjects. The essays are of varying quality, and some are too focused on Anglo-American style intelligence issues, but a number are of considerable value. All the essays were published elsewhere, and, where cited here, are given first with their original publication details. A number can be found on-line in their original edition.
- See also Robert M. Clark, (2013): "Guide to the Study of Intelligence. Perspectives on Intelligence Collection". In: *The Intelligencer. Journal of U.S. Intelligence Studies*. Volume 20, Number 2, 2013,

Session 2: (title) The intelligence cycle 1: tasking and collection

Recommended readings:

- The readings for session 1 all contain material on tasking and collection. In addition:

- A useful introduction to open source methodology is Cody Burke, "Freeing knowledge, telling secrets: Open source intelligence and development" (2007). CEWCES Research Papers, No 11. Online at http://epublications.bond.edu.au/cewcres_papers/11
- An example of how the military conceives and uses the results of human intelligence collection is the US Army Field Manual on Human Intelligence Collector Operations, latest edition 2006, online at http://armypubs.army.mil/doctrine/active_fm.html
- There is a massive collection of material on Open Source intelligence at <http://www.phibetaiota.net/category/ose/>
- Few spies have ever written reliable memoirs, but there are some books that give at least an indication of what a secret life is like. Daniel Cordier was the secretary to Jean Moulin, when the latter was head of the French Resistance. See *Alias Caracalla*, NRF 2010 (in French). Ronnie Kasrils was the head of the African National Congress's Military Intelligence Department in the Apartheid years, and later Minister for Intelligence. See his memoirs *Armed and Dangerous*, Heinemann, 1998. Larry Devlin has written about his experiences in *Chief of Station Congo*, 2008. Pierre Martinet, an agent for the French DGSE writes about the reality of gathering intelligence in *Un Agent sort de l'ombre*, Éditions Privé, 2005. Finally, Olivier Forcade, *La République Secrète: Histoire des services spéciaux français de 1918 à 1939*, Nouveau monde, 2008, describes how French intelligence tasked and collected information, at home and abroad, between the two wars.
- See also Arthur S. Hulnick ; « The Downside of Open Source Intelligence » *International Journal of Intelligence and Counter-Intelligence*; 15:4; 565-579 (2002)

Session 3: (title) The intelligence cycle 2: analyzing, judging and evaluating

Recommended readings:

- There is a huge literature on intelligence analysis, but much of it is specific to wealthy countries with large organisations, like the United States. See however the following, which are of more general interest. All of the material from the Centre for the Study of Intelligence is online.
- Roger Z George and James B Bruce (eds) *Analyzing Intelligence: Origins, Obstacles and Innovations*, Georgetown University Press, 2008.
- *The CIA's Analysis of the Soviet Union 1947-1991*, Centre for the Study of Intelligence (CIA), 2011.
- Lawrence Freedman, *US Intelligence and the Soviet Strategic Threat*, Princeton University Press, 1992.
- Benjamin B. Fisher, *A Cold War Conundrum: The 1983 Soviet War Scare*, Centre for the Study of Intelligence, 2007.
- Richard J Heuer, *Psychology of Intelligence Analysis*, Center for the Study of Intelligence, 1999, (also available as a PDF download from www.cia.gov/library/center-for-the-study-of-intelligence/index.html)
- Mark Travers et al, "The Secrecy Heuristic: Inferring Quality from Secrecy in Foreign Policy Contexts", in *Political Psychology*, Volume 35, Issue 1, pages 97–111, February 2014 (online).

- Carol Travis and Elliot Aronson, *Mistakes Were Made, but not by Me*, Pinter and Martin, 2008, is a good popular introduction to how bad decisions are taken. In the same vein, Daniel Kahneman's classic and more technical, *Thinking Fast and Slow*, Farrar, Straus, 2011
- For a good example of what happens when information is simply not available see "It's very easy to get away with lying about North Korea", <http://www.vice.com/read/a-brief-history-of-political-decoys>
- See also Julian Richards, *The Art and Science of Intelligence Analysis*, Oxford University Press, Oxford. 2010.
- Steven Marrin, « Understanding and improving intelligence analysis by learning from other disciplines », *Intelligence and National Security* », May 2017

Session 4 (Title): The intelligence cycle 3: using intelligence

Recommended readings:

- The literature on using intelligence overlaps with both analysis and intelligence "failures," and so the preceding and following readings are also relevant. See also, however:
- *National Intelligence Machinery*, 2nd edition, UK Stationery Office, London, 2002, (available online <http://www.archive.official-documents.co.uk/document/caboff/nim/natint.htm>) for a representative description of how the system as a whole is supposed to work
- The equivalent Australian organisation is online at <http://www.ona.gov.au/history/australian-intelligence-community.html>
- The US 2009 strategy for the use of intelligence is available at http://www.odni.gov/reports/2009_NIS.pdf
- The basic problems in sharing sensitive information are described in a Congressional Research Service Report, available online through www.fas.org/sgp/crs/intel/R41848.pdf

For a good historical example of the problems of using intelligence, see

- Ronald Lewin, *Ultra Goes to War*, Pen and Sword, 2008
- The use (or abuse) of intelligence leading to the Iraq war in 2003 is covered in Brain Jones, *Failing Intelligence: The True Story of how we were fooled into going to war in Iraq*, Dialogue, 2010. Written by a professional analyst the book also gives a good insight into how intelligence analysts actually work in government
- Sociological problems in intelligence agencies today are discussed in Charles Stross, "Snowden leaks: the real take-home", online at <http://www.antipope.org/charlie/blog-static/2013/08/snowden-leaks-the-real-take-ho.html>
- See also "NSA and GCHQ: the flawed psychology of government mass surveillance", online at <http://www.theguardian.com/science/head-quarters/2013/aug/26/nsa-gchq-psychology-government-mass-surveillance>
- A good sceptical article on « cyberwar » is at <http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/03071847.2014.969932>
- See also Schneier on Security: *Intelligence Analysis and the Connect-the-Dots Metaphor* http://www.schneier.com/blog/archives/2013/05/intelligence_an.html

Session 5: (title) Intelligence “failures”

Recommended readings:

For studies of modern cases of “failure” which also attempt to draw general lessons, see:

- Robert Jervis, “Why Intelligence Fails: Lessons from the Iranian Revolution and the Iraq War,” Cornell University Press, 2010.
- Review of Intelligence on Weapons of Mass Destruction, « The Butler Report » UK Stationery Office, 2004
- The Soviet Invasion of Afghanistan in 1979: Failure of Intelligence or of the Policy Process? Working Group Report, Institute for the Study of Diplomacy, Georgetown University, 2005.
- George W Allen, None So Blind: A Personal Account of the Intelligence Failure in Vietnam, Ivan R. Dee, 2001
- Vadislav M. Zubok, Soviet Intelligence and the Cold War: The « Small Committee » of Information, 1952-53, Cold War International History Project, Working Paper No 4, Woodrow Wilson Centre, 1992

Historical studies that put intelligence available at the time into a wider context include:

- RK Betts, “Surprise despite warning”, Political Science Quarterly, Vol 95, No 4 (1980), in Andrew et al.
- Julian Jackson, The Fall of France, Oxford, 2004
- Richard Overy, Russia’s War 1941-1945, Penguin 1999
- Christopher Bellamy, Absolute War, Macmillan, 2007.
- Gordon W Prange, At Dawn We Slept: The Untold Story of Pearl Harbour, Penguin, 1991
- Lawrence Freedman, The Official History of the Falklands Campaign: The Origins of the Falklands War: v. 1 (Government Official History Series, Routledge 2007.
- Woodrow J Kuhns (ed) Assessing the Soviet Threat, Centre for the Study of Intelligence, online at <https://www.cia.gov/library/center-for-the-study-of-intelligence/csi-publications/books-and-monographs/assessing-the-soviet-threat-the-early-cold-war-years/index.html>

Session 6: (title) Intelligence structures as part of Government

Recommended readings

- As well as the examples in the previous section, there are a number of reputable studies on national intelligence systems.
- Thomas C. Bruneau and Steven C Boraz, Reforming Intelligence, University of Texas Press, 2007, has essays on a number of countries, and a large bibliography.
- Ibrahim al-Marashi, “Iraq’s Security And Intelligence Network: A Guide And Analysis”, Middle Eastern Review of International Affairs, Volume 6, No. 3 - September 2002, available online at <http://meria.idc.ac.il/journal/2002/issue3/jv6n3a1.html>
- Sandy Africa and Johnny Kwadjo (eds) Changing Intelligence Dynamics in Africa, GFN-SSR 2009 (available as a PDF download from <http://www.ssrnetwork.net>)

- Christopher Andrew, *The Defence of the Realm: The Authorized History of MI5*, Penguin 2010.
- Ishmael Jones, *The Human Factor: Inside the CIA's Dysfunctional Intelligence Culture*, Encounter Books, 2010.
- Oleg Gordievsky and Christopher Andrew, *KGB: The Inside Story*, Hodder 1990.
- Maurice Faivre, *le Renseignement militaire français (1970-1985) dans le cadre de l'OTAN*, available online at http://www.stratisc.org/strat_061_FAIVRE.html
- Peter Becker, *Eyes and Ears of the Dragon: Chinese Intelligence Services Organisation and Activities*, Paper presented to the Netherlands Intelligence Studies Association, online at <http://www.nisa-intelligence.org/PDF-bestanden/NISAcongresBecker.pdf>
- Philip Davies, "Ideas of Intelligence: Divergent national concepts and institutions," *Harvard International Review*, Vol 24, No 3 (2002) contrasts the US and British cultures. (In Andrew, et al)
- Petr.Zeman "Intelligence Services of the Czech Republic: Current Legal Development and Its Status," 2007. http://www.uzsi.cz/uploads/cis_2006.pdf.
- Robert Pringle . (1998) "The heritage and future of the Russian intelligence community", *International Journal of Intelligence and Counterintelligence*, 11(2): 175-184

Session 7: (title) Intelligence and Politics

Recommended readings:

- Stéphane.Lefebvre, "The Czech Experience With Intelligence Reforms, 1993–2010." *International Journal of Intelligence and CounterIntelligence* 24, no. 4 (December 2011):
- Weeks, Gregory, "A Preference for Deference: reforming the military's intelligence role in Argentina, Chile and Peru", *Third World Quarterly*, Vol. 29, No. 1, 2008,
- S. Jankovic, (2006) *Democratic Civil Control of Intelligence-Security Services in Serbia*. Belgrade Centre for Security Policy. Available at: <http://www.bezbednost.org/All-publications/4213/Democratic-Civil-Control-of-IntelligenceSecurity.shtml>
- Larry L Watts, « Intelligence Reform in Europe's Emerging Democracies », *Studies in Intelligence*, Vol 48, No 1, 2004, is a good general survey.
- Richard K. Betts, *The New Politics of Intelligence: Will Reforms Work This Time?* *Foreign Affairs*, May/June 2004, concentrates on the politicization of intelligence in the US.
- A survey of the Anglo-Saxon world (now a little dated) is Peter Gill, *Policing Politics: Security Intelligence and the Liberal Democratic State*, Routledge, 1994.
- For how intelligence works in a one-party state see Ibrahim al-Marashi, "Iraq's Security And Intelligence Network: A Guide And Analysis", *Middle Eastern Review of International Affairs*, Volume 6, No. 3 - September 2002, available online at <http://meria.idc.ac.il/journal/2002/issue3/jv6n3a1.html>
- A skeptical and historical view of the definition of the "national interest" is Scott Burchill, *The National Interest in International Relations Theory*, Palgrave, 2005
- For an account of how British intellectuals were spied on during the Cold War see "MI5 spied on leading British historians for decades, secret files reveal", <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2014/oct/24/mi5-spied-historians-eric-hobsbawm-christopher-hill-secret-files>

Session 8: (title) Ethics: Ends and Means

Recommended readings:

- Jean Maria Arrigo, "Military and Civilian Perspectives on the Ethics of Intelligence", online at <http://isme.tamu.edu/JSCOPE01/Arrigo01.html> is a contribution by a philosopher.
- The International Intelligence Ethics Association has its own Internet site and journal. See <http://intelligence-ethics.org/journal/index.html>
- Jan Goldman (ed), *Ethics of Spying: A Reader for the Intelligence Professional*, Scarecrow Press, 2005
- An EU funded study on benefits and dangers of mass surveillance is described at <http://justsecurity.org/16336/eu-funded-study-electronic-mass-surveillance-fails-drastically/>
- Tom O'Connor has a large selection of material related to intelligence ethics on his website at <http://www.drtoconnor.com/4125/4125lect04.htm>
- David Omand, "Ethical guidelines in using secret intelligence for public security,"
- *Cambridge Review of International Affairs*, Vol 19, No 4 (2006). In Andrew et al.
- See also Michael Sander Justice: What's the Right Thing to Do, Farrar, Strauss and Ginoux, 2009, is a good general introduction.
- David Omand, "Understanding Digital Intelligence and the Norms that might Govern It", at https://www.cigionline.org/sites/default/files/gcig_paper_no8.pdf

Session 9: (title) Intelligence and the Law

Recommended readings:

Representative examples of intelligence legislation are:

- The 1994 UK Intelligence Services Act (online at <http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/1994/13/contents>)
- The 1978 US Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act, online at <http://www.law.cornell.edu/uscode/text/50/chapter-36>
- The Canadian Security Intelligence Service Act of 1985 <http://laws-lois.justice.gc.ca/eng/acts/c-23/index.html>
- A comparative study of different procedures by the Geneva Centre for the Democratic Control of Armed Forces is at <http://www.dcaf.ch/publications/kms/details.cfm?id=18718&nav1=4>
- An independent survey of the effects of US procedures and legislation is at https://www.pclob.gov/Library/215-Report_on_the_Telephone_Records_Program-2.pdf

Session 10: (title) Intelligence in a Democracy

Recommended readings:

- Thomas C. Bruneau And Kenneth R. Dombrosk, Reforming Intelligence: The Challenge Of Control In New Democracies, available online at <http://www2.warwick.ac.uk/fac/soc/pais/people/aldrich/vigilant/bruneau.pdf>
- Frederic Grare, Reforming the Intelligence Agencies in Pakistan's Transitional Democracy, Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, 2009, online at http://www.carnegieendowment.org/files/pakistan_intelligence_transitional_democracy.pdf discusses several other countries as well.
- Ministerial Review Commission on Intelligence, Intelligence in a constitutional democracy, Final Report, Pretoria, South Africa, September 2008,
- Intelligence Practice and Democratic Oversight, DCAF Occasional paper No 3, online at [www.dcaf.ch](http://crookedtimber.org/2014/06/19/cross-national-intelligence-and-national-democracy/) <http://crookedtimber.org/2014/06/19/cross-national-intelligence-and-national-democracy/>
- Elizabeth Sepper, "Democracy, Human Rights and Intelligence Sharing", in <http://www.tilj.org/content/journal/46/num1/Sepper151.pdf>
- Nicholas Weaver, The Limits of The Panopticon <https://www.lawfareblog.com/limits-panopticon>

Session 11: (title) Practical Exercise

Session 12: (title) Conclusion